

# New Mandala

Home Thailand Burma Malaysia Laos Cambodia Singapore Book Reviews



CONTRIBUTING TO NM ABOUT

## Recent Posts

- **Trans\*cending tribulations: Malaysian Mak Nyahs**
- **China and Myanmar's reforms**
- **Democracy and human rights in Southeast Asia**
- **The Laksi gunfight**
- **Thai election by the numbers**
- **Politics of electoral protest in Thailand**
- **The weakness of the Thai royalists**
- **Thailand's 'Days of our Strife'**
- **Review of It's a Living**
- **Thailand's 3D Conflict**
- **Thailand's election: 2 February 2014**
- **A response to Vanina Sucharitkul**
- **Thailand's electorate deserves respect**
- **The dark and treacherous road to Putrajaya**
- **Puteri, wanita, ... dan UMNO**

## Book Reviews

**Review of It's a Living**  
06 February 2014 9:25 AM | 1 Comment

Annuska Derks reviews a book that examines how ordinary people live the incredible changes underway in Vietnam today

[READ MORE](#)

**Review of Worshipping the Great Moderniser**  
07 January 2014 8:29 AM | 5 Comments

Erick White reviews an important new book on Thailand's King Chulalongkorn

[READ MORE](#)

**Review of One Man's View of the World**  
13 December 2013 8:27 AM | 16 Comments

Nina Ong reviews a book by a man who remains steadfast in his convictions, despite their archaic qualities

[READ MORE](#)

**Review of A Civilized Woman**  
22 November 2013 8:24 AM | 2 Comments

In this review, Thak Chaloeintiarana examines the fading world of the Thai nobility after 1932

## Trans\*cending tribulations: Malaysian Mak Nyahs

BY JOSEPH GOH, GUEST CONTRIBUTOR – 11 FEBRUARY 2014

POSTED IN: DISCRIMINATION, MALAYSIA



The term 'trans\*' is an inclusive referent for all non-conforming gender identities, and challenges the notion that biological sex necessarily dictates and determines gender identity. Male-to-female trans\* persons are individuals who are born with male genitalia, but who largely identify as women. In many parts of Malaysia, pre-operative and post-operative male-to-female transsexuals call themselves *mak nyah*, a term which they coined in 1987 to distinguish themselves from gay men and as a preferred appellation of dignity. Female-to-male transsexuals or transmen are significantly fewer than *mak nyahs*, and "constitute a minority within a minority" in Malaysia. Trans\* persons have long been important figures in the landscape of the Malay archipelago. In the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the *manang bali* or Iban shamans who dressed as women were respectable curers and local leaders. Right up to the 20<sup>th</sup> century in the archipelago, many transwomen were royal courtiers. Transwomen village performers were also favourably treated by the Sultan of the state of Kelantan in the 1960s. Such amenable attitudes towards transwomen underwent a change from the 1970s onwards, notably due to the expanding Islamisation of Malaysia. In 1983, the Malaysian Conference of Rulers declared a *fatwa* against cross-dressing and genital reconstruction surgery (GRS). This was a reaction from the Malay monarchy towards former premier Mahathir Mohamad, who challenged their traditional authority on various levels. As this systematic religio-political rejection of the personhoods of *mak nyahs* persists to this day in numerous circles, many Malaysian transwomen find it near impossible to secure gainful employment and some resort to sex work. This, in turn, places many of them at great risk of exposure to HIV and other sexually-transmitted infections.

*Mak nyahs* often fall prey to the scorn of society, as is evident from widespread instances of derogatory name-calling and violence. Malay-Muslim *mak nyahs* are particularly vulnerable to Malaysian legalities, including *Syariah* laws and the Minor Offence Act 1955. They can be charged and imprisoned for "immoral purposes" and "indecent behaviour," and many experience numerous atrocities during incarceration. Moreover, they are constantly pressured to "reform" and "repent from sin" due to their liminal identities. Any attempt on their part to amend their names and gender on Malaysia identity cards to reflect how they understand and wish to identify themselves are met with failure, as evinced in the case of Aleesha Farhana in 2011. In 2012, *mak nyahs* in the state of Negeri Sembilan lost a court case in which they challenged a law that permitted the prosecution of Malay-Muslim cross-dressing men.

Despite the multiple experiences of hostility, many *mak nyahs* continue to work towards self-empowerment. The non-governmental, community-based organisation in the Malaysian capital city of Kuala Lumpur, PT Foundation, has *mak nyahs* heading and staffing the Mak Nyah Programme for the physical and psychological welfare of *mak nyahs*. In the state of Pahang, 12 *mak nyahs* from the Drug Intervention Community of Pahang participated in an Independence Day 2013 parade. The government of the state of Penang has been particularly supportive of *mak nyahs* by setting up a special committee to investigate the welfare of *mak nyahs* and appointing *mak nyah* Hezreen Shaik Daud as the political secretary of Tanjung Bungah assemblyman Teh Yee Cheu. Some Malay-Muslim *mak nyahs* are also reclaiming their rights as Muslims, and their lived experiences attest to how they reconstitute Islamic tenets in ways that affirm them as *mak nyahs*.

One particularly noteworthy initiative by Malaysian trans\* persons is the "I AM YOU

Search...



## Recent Comments

- **China and Myanmar's reforms (2)**
  - **plan B:** Kudos to Trevor Wilson for this exhausting reference and counter references. Even...
  - **Peter Cohen:** Myanmar's reforms ? Is that like 10 days of electricity out of each month, in...
- **The King Never Smiles? (384)**
  - **Ghost of Jit Phoomisak:** Richard, unlike the vast majority of Americans, you do have a good idea...
  - **Ghost of Jit Phoomisak:** Once again you make sweeping claims yet provide little or no...
  - **Ghost of Jit Phoomisak:** Clearly, the main point the king was making was that we ALL need to...
  - **Ghost of Jit Phoomisak:** There are thousands of angry rice farmers who would disagree with you if...
  - **Ralph Kramden:** So can we assume that you are from Thailand? And if we can, what, exactly, does...
  - **Sceptic:** Sorry, used the wrong tag to close italics! The post should read: The whole point the...
- **The weakness of the Thai royalists (31)**
  - **Passerby:** Yes, it is said to be HIS men now bodyguarding PM for a while. Although he is currently...
  - **fall:** Two things: 1. Invisible power is all-great-and-powerful as long as it remain invisible....
  - **Ondřej Kodytek:** Peter Cohen was not so wrong after all... now there is a poster who does...
  - **George Redelinghuys:** This may not belong to this brilliant article, therefore, my apologies. I...
  - **Jon Wright:** Why does Jory put the Crown Prince in the red Corner ? Personally, I think the...
  - **Elvis:** There will not be a military or judicial coup. The invisible hand has been

READ MORE



### Review of Aid Dependence in Cambodia

14 November 2013 8:49 AM | 4 Comments

Sokunpanha You reviews a book that should be required reading for every politician and bureaucrat in Cambodia

READ MORE



### Review of Brave New Burma

17 October 2013 8:04 AM | 3 Comments

Andrew Selth reviews Nic Dunlop's well-researched account of a country that seems to be emerging from 50 years of military rule

READ MORE



### Review of Singapore, ASEAN and the Cambodian Conflict

10 October 2013 8:58 AM | 6 Comments

Nicholas Tarling reviews a new book that is full of insights and rounded off with an insightful summary

READ MORE



### Reviews of Bangkok Bound

30 September 2013 9:58 AM | 2 Comments

The appearance of Ellen Bocuzzi's book leads us to release two complimentary reviews, each written by the author of a major forthcoming work in the field of Thai literature and cultural history

READ MORE



### Review of Renunciation and Power

10 September 2013 9:42 AM | 2 Comments

Matthew Walton reviews an excellent book that scholars of religion and society in Myanmar must read

READ MORE



### Review of Southeast Asia and the Rise of China

06 September 2013 10:11 AM | 2 Comments

David Dapice reviews a useful compendium of a huge amount of diplomatic history

READ MORE



### Review of Floating on a Malayan Breeze

08 August 2013 8:00 AM | 1 Comment

Elvin Ong reviews Floating on a Malayan Breeze, a "bottom-up" perspective on contemporary Singapore and Malaysia.

READ MORE

One particularly noteworthy initiative by Malaysian trans\* persons is the "I AM YOU: Be a Trans Ally" campaign by an up-and-coming Malaysian trans\* organisation that aims "to foster understanding and to promote tolerance and acceptance towards trans people." The campaign "represents a force of concerned members of the public, joined together in common purpose, to establish a positive images of trans\* identities and communities." To this end, this campaign has produced videos and promotional posters. These videos feature the insights and experiences of a transman and various *mak nyahs*. The campaign has also created an Info Kit which consists of a DVD of 5 videos, as well as an info comic entitled "19 Ways to be a Trans\* Ally" which was designed by the *mak nyah* artist Shieko Reto. Among other things, the info comic debunks essentialised gender and sexuality presumptions, provides information on how to interact with trans\* persons, encourages solidarity with trans\* persons and exhorts the construction of spaces for dialogue with trans\* persons. This Info Kit was launched at the "19 Ways to be a Trans\* Ally" event at Annexe Gallery, Central Market in Kuala Lumpur, in the evening of December 14, 2013. The event also featured passionate sharings from a transman, two *mak nyahs* and their allies. During the launch, *mak nyah* activist Nisha Ayub reiterated the struggles, hopes and dreams of trans\* persons in fighting for the right to be themselves as trans\* persons in Malaysia, free from fear, discrimination, stigmatisation, violence and prosecution.

As Malaysia enters the 57<sup>th</sup> year of its independence and its 51<sup>st</sup> year of formation as a country, I challenge the country to adopt an attitude of radical and unconditional inclusivity for all its citizens without exception. In his speech during the declaration of independence of the Federation of Malaya in 1957, then Chief Minister Tunku Abdul Rahman provided a glowing vision for the Federation as one which is founded on "the principles of liberty and justice and ... the welfare and happiness of its people." Malaysia must assume the prophetic courage of Tunku Abdul Rahman, not only from political, religious and socio-economic perspectives, but in the treatment of all its gender-variant and sexually-diverse citizens who ask for recognition, respect and equal treatment in their journey of meaning-making and self-realisation.

**Joseph N. Goh is a Ph.D. candidate in Gender, Sexuality and Theology with the School of Arts and Social Sciences at Monash University, Malaysia. He is a member of the Emerging Queer Asian Pacific Islander Religion Scholars (EQARS) and editor of the Queer Asian Spirit E-Magazine.**

#### Selected References

"19 WAYS TO BE A TRANS ALLY!," Facebook Event, December 14, 2013, <https://www.facebook.com/events/269768886508535/?ref=22>, accessed January 31, 2014.

"I AM YOU: Be A Trans Ally!," <http://mytransally.weebly.com/what-is-trans.html>, accessed January 31, 2014.

Farish A. Noor, *What Your Teacher Didn't Tell You: The Annexe Lectures* (Petaling Jaya, Selangor, Malaysia: Matahari Books, 2010).

Goh, Joseph N., "Nyah-Islam: The Reconstruction of God and Institutional Islam by Malaysian Male-to-Female Transsexuals," *In God's Image* 31, no. 2 (2012): 33-44.

Greenberg, David F. *The Construction of Homosexuality* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1988).

Khartini Slamah, "The Struggle to Be Ourselves, Neither Men nor Women: Mak Nyahs in Malaysia," in *Sexuality, Gender and Rights: Exploring Theory and Practice in South and Southeast Asia*, ed. Geetanjali Misra and Radhika Chandiramani (London: Sage Publications Ltd, 2005).

Peletz, Michael G., "Transgenderism and Gender Pluralism in Southeast Asia since Early Modern Times," *Current Anthropology* 47, no. 2 (April 2006): 309-339.

PT Foundation, "Mak Nyah Programme: Transgenders," [http://www.ptfmalaysia.org/transgender\\_programme.php](http://www.ptfmalaysia.org/transgender_programme.php), accessed January 31, 2014.

Yik Koon Teh, "Politics and Islam: Factors Determining Identity and the Status of Male-to-Female Transsexuals in Malaysia," in *AsiaPacifiQueer: Rethinking Genders and Sexualities*, ed. Fran Martin et al. (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2008).

Share this:



checkmated....

- **Trans\*cending tribulations: Malaysian Mak Nyahs (1)**
- **Peter Cohen:** "Malaysia must assume the prophetic courage of Tunku Abdul Rahman, not only from..."
- **A response to Vanita Sucharitkul (23)**
- **George Redelinghuys:** Simply brilliant piece of writing from a razor-sharp legal mind. Thank-you.
- **The Laksi gunfight (25)**
- **George Thomas:** I expect this to get minimal attention in those circles backing the...
- **Sam Deedes:** Police forensics indicate 39 shots came from the PDRC and 3 from the red shirts....
- **Middle class rage threatens democracy (121)**
- **Guest:** Dear Weng, First, compassion to you. Second, you have come across as an ill-informed...
- **Sceptic:** Does that not just show what a fickle, ignorant bunch most of the Bangkok middle-class...
- **George Redelinghuys:** The "reforms" will be the following: The election results will...
- **George Redelinghuys:** Dear Neptunian, I love this comment of yours. A man after my own heart....
- **weng:** On Therevada Buddhism & Thai polity, are they co-related? Please study Monastic Code...
- **Thai election by the numbers (5)**
- **Tim Meisburger:** There is little potential profit in comparing turnout figures in this election...
- **Alex:** About the "Vote No" There is an interesting analysis of Thai Intelligence...
- **Malaysia's economic transformation programme (2)**
- **plan B:** Singapore will be dictating the economy of Malaysia. Even Chinese interests has to go...

#### Categories

Select Category

#### Archives (2006 - 2013)

Select Month

#### Admin

- [Log in](#)
- [Entries RSS](#)
- [Comments RSS](#)
- [WordPress.org](#)

#### 1 Comment

#### This Week's Trending Posts